

April 16, 2019

Members of the Byram Township Council,

Attached you will find a summary of the extensive work performed by this subcommittee and our initial findings and recommendations. This subcommittee has endeavored to work toward a solution for a municipal and police facility that the town can be proud of and that we, as taxpayers, feel is as cost conscious and cost effective as can be achieved given the myriad of constraints from location to regulation.

For almost a year, the members of this subcommittee have spent a substantial amount of their valuable personal time attending meetings, reviewing documents, visiting other municipal sites, and conducting research in a focused effort to find the best solution for a municipal and police facility. The group has brought diverse backgrounds, talents, perspectives, and beliefs to this task. Our discussions have ranged from cordial and collegial to contentious and confrontational. However, there has always been a sustained level of mutual respect in our interactions, given that we all have a vested interest in the outcome of our combined effort.

Members of this committee unanimously agree that action is necessary to address the current building needs of the municipality, police department, and community. The subcommittee further recognizes the public's expectation that it operates in the public interest to identify a fiscally responsible solution.

It is important to note that while the enclosed report does identify preliminary cost estimates, the subcommittee does not present those estimates as conclusive. Instead, the subcommittee views these numbers as preliminary comparative data that has assisted us in narrowing our recommendations. These preliminary estimates require more substantial investigation and analysis. This can be accomplished as the subcommittee moves this process forward to more narrowly define the project scope and details.

The members of the subcommittee appreciate the support and patience of the Council, our friends, neighbors and fellow residents of Byram Township. We look forward to the next phase of the subcommittee's work. At the end of this stage as described above, we should have a well vetted, well understood solution that can be presented to the township residents.

Sincerely,

Members of the Building Subcommittee

*Tony Chelpaty
Skip Danielson
Cris Franco
Carlos Luaces
John Morytko
Stephen Panek
Michael Pellek
James Reinhold*

*Donald Robbins
David Romano
Harvey Roseff (Town Council)
Larry Rotter
Alex Rubenstein (Mayor)
Joseph Sabatini (Township Manager)
Eric Serrilli
Scott Yappen*

Summary of Work and Preliminary Recommendations of the Municipal Building Subcommittee

May 21, 2018 - April 16, 2019

Objective of Subcommittee

The structures that comprise the Byram Township Municipal Administrative Offices and Police Department are at the end of their service life. At least half of the space is comprised of forty-year old construction trailers, and the remainder is in need of renovation or rehabilitation. In recent years, there has been significant work to resolve this issue but a final determination has not been made. Two prior attempts to address the municipal building project proved unsuccessful after concerns and subsequent petitions from members of the public resulted in the Township Council retracting the proposal.

In early 2018, the newly elected Township Council established a subcommittee for the purpose of identifying a solution to address municipal building and community needs. This new subcommittee was charged with reviewing prior municipal building plans, scope, and process with a fresh perspective and asked to incorporate new approaches and assessments. The Council gave considerable latitude and time to explore any and all options.

Members of the Building Subcommittee:

Tony Chelpaty (Township Resident)
Skip Danielson (Township Resident)
Cris Franco (Township Resident)
Carlos Luaces (Township Resident)
John Morytko (Township Resident)
Stephen Panek (Township Resident)
Michael Pellek (Township Resident)
James Reinhold (Township Resident)

Donald Robbins (Township Resident)
David Romano (Township Business Owner)
Harvey Roseff (Councilman & Resident)
Larry Rotter (Township Resident)
Alex Rubenstein (Mayor & Resident)
Joseph Sabatini (Township Manager & Resident)
Eric Serrilli (Township Resident)
Scott Yappen (Township Resident)

History of Existing Municipal Building

The Byram Township Municipal Building includes two separate structures – the Shed Roof Building (referred in previous reports as the Upper Building) and the Masonry Building (referred to in previous reports as the Lower Building). Each building is connected by an enclosed passageway. The Byram Township Municipal Building Assessment prepared by FKA Architects in 2015 summarizes the history of the buildings as follows:

The Masonry Building (Lower Building) “was the original building on the site and was constructed in 1971,” making this building approximately 48 years old. “This structure is a one-story building with a masonry façade and is wood framed with a flat roof construction.”

The Shed Roof Building (Upper Building) “is constructed of twelve (12) modular temporary trailers that are connected together, and were assembled on site in approximately 1975. A false façade, and roof

truss canopy system, was constructed around these units, in 1991, to disguise the appearance of the modular units.”

It should be noted that according to the US Census of Population and Housing there were 4,592 Byram residents in 1970 and as of 2010 there were 8,350 residents. The scale and nature of the township’s business community has also grown substantially since 1970.

Condition of Existing Buildings

The subcommittee reviewed the prior Building Assessment, discussed current building status with the Township Manager, and toured the existing facilities. Per the Building Assessment, the Shed Roof Building “is well beyond its useful life expectancy” and identified the “useful life expectancy” of the 48-year-old Masonry Building at “approximately 50 years.”

The Assessment further adds: “There are visible operational challenges with the current buildings – particularly the police department – which does not meet current standards. The buildings are not mechanically efficient with failing heating, ventilation and air conditioning (HVAC) systems. The modular units are well beyond their useful life with the ceiling framing system, interior partition framing, and subflooring in poor condition needing replacing. The roof of the original structure leaks and requires a new roofing system. The windows and doors are not energy efficient. The buildings are not ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act) compliant.”

The subcommittee has found that the existing building conditions are consistent with the 2015 Assessment and continues to deteriorate due to substantial challenges with the Mortar Building roof, HVAC, and mold issues.

Review of Prior Work

Substantial time was spent reviewing the building and site-related work performed over the past five years. The subcommittee was provided extensive documentation (outlined below) and substantial narrative insight from Township Manager, Joe Sabatini. The subcommittee also met with Mark Alpaugh of MJA Construction Services to discuss his Detailed Cost Estimate dated May 5, 2017. The total estimate at that time, inclusive of hard and soft costs, was \$7,327,260. Mr. Alpaugh provided insight into his methodology, project assumptions, and insight on other municipal projects. Former township resident, Fred Braun, provided insight into his involvement with the construction of the roof and brick facade for the Shed Roof Building.

Documents and reports provided to the subcommittee include the following:

- Township of Byram Municipal Building Plans, dated 3/1971, prepared by William J. Wilson, AIA Architect.
- Additions and Alterations to the Byram Township Intermediate School, dated illegible, prepared by Hamnett, Bouman & Blanche, PA.
- Roof Scope Narrative, dated 1/11/2013, prepared by HQW Architects, LLC.
- Building Mechanical Systems Evaluation, dated 10/10/2014, prepared by Strunk-Albert Engineering.
- Byram Township Municipal Building Programing Document, dated 8/26/2015, prepared by FKA Architects.
- Byram Township Municipal Building Assessment, dated 9/11/2015, prepared by FKA Architects.

- Byram Township Municipal Complex Master Plan Options, dated 10/12/2015, prepared by FKA Architects.
- Summary of Spaces, dated 11/9/2015, prepared by FKA Architects.
- Municipal Staff Breakdown, date unknown, preparer unknown.
- Byram Township Municipal Complex Master Plan Options, dated 3/8/2016, prepared by FKA Architects.
- Cost Estimate, dated 3/8/2016, prepared by FKA Architects.
- Option Floorplans, dated 3/16/2017, prepared by FKA Architects.
- Site Options, dated 3/16/2017, prepared by FKA Architects.
- Summary of Spaces, Option #5, dated 3/21/2017, prepared by FKA Architects.
- Byram Township New Municipal Building Schematic Estimate Summary, dated 5/5/2017, prepared by MJA Construction Services.
- Document 00 91 13 Addendum Number 01 Open Space Re-Roofing at Byram IS, dated 5/3/2018, prepared by Parette Somjen Architects LLC.
- Byram Township Municipal Building Proposed Expansion Environmental Plan, dated 11/2018, prepared by Cory L. Stoner, PE.
- Byram Township Municipal Building Proposed Parking Lot Expansion Concept Plan, dated 11/2018, prepared by Cory L. Stoner, PE.
- Preliminary Engineering & Environmental Permit Review for the Byram Township Municipal Building Renovation/Reconstruction and Byram Township Intermediate School Parking Area Options, dated 11/2/2018, prepared by Harold E. Pellow & Associates, Inc.
- Environmental Analysis for the Byram Township Municipal Building Complex, undated, prepared by Harold E. Pellow & Associates, Inc

Review of Summary of Program Space

The Summary of Program Space prepared by FKA Architects in 2017 outlines the necessary workspace, meeting facilities, storage needs, and other facility requirements of the municipal government and police department. Building square footage, layout, and project concepts are influenced, in large part, by this summary.

In the summer of 2015, all department heads individually met with the FKA Architects to provide their input and wish list of items for the new building. This resulted in the Byram Township Municipal Building Programming Document dated August 26, 2015. At the October 20, 2015 meeting of the Mayor and Council, the architect reviewed the programming document and it was concluded that the program needed to be scaled down. The original program presented a building size of 20,464 sq. ft. At the November 16, 2015 meeting of the Mayor and Council, a revised programming report (modification #1) was reviewed demonstrating new total of 16,309 sq. ft. (reduction of approximately 20%). At the November 1, 2016 meeting of the Mayor and Council, the architect was authorized to conduct additional program review meetings with each of the department heads and the prior building subcommittee to determine if there were further opportunities for modifications that could reduce the overall square footage. This resulted in Option 5 (dated March 2017), presenting building size at 14,385 sq. ft.

The March 2017 version of 14,385 sq. ft. was the basis for this subcommittee's work. This subcommittee agreed that it is generally in line with the needs of the township. Further analysis of the program space was not pursued but has been a subject of discussion and we believe merits further review in the next phase of the municipal building process.

Municipal & Police Facility Site Visits

In order to gain perspectives and insights regarding other municipal facilities, the subcommittee made four site visits outside of Byram including the Andover Township Police Department, the Lafayette Municipal Building, the Blirstown Township Municipal Building, and the Stillwater Township Municipal Building. These locations were chosen for various reasons, including purpose, location, age, and construction method, among other things.

The site visits provided lessons learned by other municipalities including anecdotal insight into their process and decisions. These visits also provided the committee a firsthand experience with other municipal facilities that offered ideas to consider and avoid in the areas of design elements, site work considerations, other project elements. For instance, an interesting recurring theme was that, almost universally, other municipalities felt that did not have enough storage room. In visiting these other buildings, it also became clear that layout of the space is critically important as it was apparent to the committee that in at least two of these locations, poor layout resulted in an inefficient use of space and construction costs. The prior building subcommittee had previously made site visits to several municipal buildings including Wanaque, Hardyston and Warren Township.

Investigation of Alternative Building Sites

The subcommittee discussed the possibility of relocating the municipal and police buildings from the Mansfield Drive property. A discussion of the adaptive reuse of existing structures in town included the former Frogmore property on Rte. 206, an unoccupied retail property on Tamarack Road, the State DOT facility on Rte. 206, and the Fire Department property on Rte. 206. The subcommittee also reviewed the 2017 analysis of commercial properties including the aforementioned unoccupied retail property on Tamarack Road, the location of the now closed Adam Todd, a building at 7 Waterloo Road (now occupied by Capitol Care), and the former Lakeland Bank building (now occupied by Chase Bank).

Ultimately these sites were eliminated from further consideration due to a number of challenges including site plan limitations, lack of sewer service, costs related to acquisition and renovation, and the loss of tax revenue related to these properties.

Representatives of the subcommittee also met with State Senator Steven Oroho regarding potential public/private partnerships legislation to explore its impact on our efforts including potential alternative sites. The proposed legislation and its applicability to our work was subsequently not deemed relevant.

One alternative site - the Open Space portion of the Byram Intermediate School - generated significant interest by the subcommittee and was the subject of substantial investigation and analysis. Discussion focused on placing the municipal administrative and meeting spaces in a portion of the Open Space facility. A series of meetings and communications with the Byram Board of Education and school administration ensued. Further details related to our investigation of the Open Space are provided in this report and at length in The Nader Group reports.

Preliminary Site Options & Decision to Hire Professional

Once the subcommittee identified the current 10 Mansfield Drive property as a central component of the municipal building plans, it quickly became apparent that three general options existed for consideration.

Those options consisted of the following general concepts:

1. Use of Byram Intermediate School Open Space and Mortar Building: The subcommittee entered into discussions with the Byram school administration to identify parameters of potential municipal use for a portion of the Open Space facility. The vision was to move the administrative function of the Township to the Open Space, then renovate the Mortar Building as a stand-alone police department. The Shed Roof Building would be demolished.
2. Reconstruction of the Shed Building and Mortar Building: In this option, the concept centered on repurposing the Mortar Building for a stand-alone police department and using the shell of the Shed Roof Building. The trailers that make up the interior of the Shed Roof building would be deconstructed and removed leaving behind the roof, foundation, footings, and facade that exists today.
3. Construction of an entirely new building: This option was discussed, but had been the least debated by the committee. The subcommittee did not want to rule out the possibility of a new structure because of the potential advantages in terms of layout flexibility, facility longevity, and possible continued use of current buildings during construction.

The subcommittee determined further analysis of these options would require professional assistance. A request was made to the Township Council to approve funding and issue an RFP for professional services. The resulting action resulted in nine RFP submissions and ultimately the Township Council selected The Nader Group.

The Nader Group Process

The subcommittee first met with The Nader Group on December 5, 2018 to review the ongoing work and process. The general concepts outlined earlier in this report were discussed and the subcommittee charged them with investigating site and construction related details related to those options. It was also made clear they were not restricted to only those options and encouraged additional ideas and concepts.

The Nader Group was provided with all of the information and material made available to the subcommittee from the previous attempts. They met with the Superintendent of Byram Schools to look at the Open Space section on 3 separate occasions, inspected the existing municipal site multiple times and spoke with staff, inspected the building, shed roof and foundation of the Police Facility.

At the February 26, 2019 meeting, the Nader Group presented their initial findings and concepts to the Township Council and building subcommittee. This initial report laid out their review of the three primary options and produced a matrix, grading each option. Their analysis concluded that the outer shell and possibly the roof of the Mortar Building was salvageable but the Shed Roof Building “is not feasible for re-use”. Their top 2 options (based on their matrix) were presented with block layout plans and concept site plans. The subcommittee subsequently asked them to incorporate concept plans and analysis that also included the Open Space portion of Byram Intermediate School.

Based on their findings they presented a variety of concept plans. The following is a brief summary of these plans (full details can be found in their March 2019 Analysis Report - Byram Municipal Complex)

Option 1 - Combination New Construction and Mortar Building

- Alternative A – Three separate buildings including renovation of the mortar building, construction of a “civic building” that would house meeting and storage space, and police building with a sally port. This three-phased construction would not require temporary office trailers during an estimated 12-15-month construction. *Preliminary Cost Estimate: \$6,193,376.50*
- Alternative B – Rehabilitation of the Mortar Building for administrative use with a new construction expansion to house meeting and storage space. Separate police building with a sally port would be constructed. Temporary trailers would be required to house the administrative and police functions during the construction process. *Preliminary Cost Estimate: \$5,478,833.25*
- Alternative C – This option is similar to that laid out in Option 1B but with an alternative layout that would not require the use of temporary trailers for municipal and police functions during construction. The Shed Roof Building would house all staff during a single-phase 12-month construction and would be demolished as part of the project completion. *Preliminary Cost Estimate: \$5,427,719.25*

Option 2 - New Construction

- Construction of two new buildings - one for administrative and meeting space and a separate police building. New building would mean complete demolition of Shed Roof Building and Mortar Building. Temporary trailers would be necessary to house administrative and police functions during 12-month construction. *Preliminary Cost Estimate: \$5,973,320.55*

Option 3 – Byram Intermediate School Open Space and Mortar Building Renovations

- Alternative A – Renovation of Open Space for use as administrative offices and civic meeting spaces. The Mortar Building would be renovated for use by the police department. *Preliminary Cost Estimate: \$5,406,789.00*
- Alternative B – Renovation of Open Space for use as administrative offices and civic meeting spaces. A new police building would be constructed on the 10 Mansfield Drive property. *Preliminary Cost Estimate: \$5,646,811.20*

Summary of Preliminary Findings & Conclusions of the Subcommittee

1. The existing municipal structures have reached the end of their useful life. The Mortar Building may be repurposed by way of a gut renovation and use of existing walls and possibly the roof structure. The recommendations of two independent parties (FKA Architects in 2015 and The Nader Group in 2019) have concluded that the renovation of the existing Shed Roof Building is not a viable option.
2. The present state of the municipal and police facilities is a detriment to the Township due to maintenance costs, inefficient HVAC, a poor and potentially unhealthy work environment, and serves as a poor reflection of the community to potential residents and businesses.
3. The condition of the police facility, in particular, highlights the need for action to provide municipal and police facilities that offer the necessary work environment to provide Byram Township residents with safe and efficient services.

4. The current municipal property on Mansfield Drive is the most cost-effective site for new and improved municipal and police facilities. The benefits of the property include:
 - Township owned
 - Existing sewer connection
 - Plenty of room for municipal, police, and DPW facilities
 - Existing Mortar Building provides potential renovation opportunities
5. The use of the Open Space portion of the Byram Intermediate School was eliminated from consideration when school safety concerns, work efficiency losses, parking/traffic concerns, environmental, and other concerns were combined with a lack of savings on project development costs.
6. The construction of a new police facility will require that it meet New Jersey and International Building Code definitions of an Essential Facility. The options presented in this report separate the police facility from the administrative functions in an attempt to reduce overall project costs by eliminating the need for the entire municipal complex to meet these more stringent requirements.
7. Viable options exist for renovation of the Mortar Building and new construction. Based on the Nader Group preliminary findings, the subcommittee feels Option 1C (as presented in their March 2019 report) provides the preferred concept plan for a cost-effective solution to the Township's needs. This plan provides for:
 - a. Repurposing the existing Mortar Building for municipal administrative offices
 - b. Construction of an expansion to the Mortar Building to house municipal meeting and storage space
 - c. The construction of a separate police building to meet the "essential services building" code requirements
 - d. Continued use of existing municipal and police facilities during the construction and renovation project
8. This phase of the process has yielded preliminary costs associated with each building option. The subcommittee is comfortable with these numbers for comparative purposes but believes that they do not reflect an accurate enough estimate to recommend bonding/financing. The subcommittee believes further investigation and analysis will lead to additional cost saving opportunities and a more accurate estimate of bonding/financing.

Recommendations of the Building Subcommittee

In consideration of the forgoing sections of this report, it is this subcommittee's belief that we have concluded the initial phase of a multi-phase effort. While the subcommittee is recommending to move forward with a concept site plan based on The Nader Group's report, there is a substantial amount of work to be done to truly define what that means in terms of cost, time and the final product. While the subcommittee is convinced that, on a comparative basis, the "Combination" option is the best solution, the best version of this option has yet to be developed. Thus, the subcommittee recommends the following:

1. Engage The Nader Group to develop advanced concept plans of the Combination Option 1C, possibly 2 or 3 versions that would include detailed floor plans, elevations with exterior finish options and roof line profiles, fenestration options, structural and mechanical systems narratives and evaluations, and site plan schematics.
2. Engage the services of an independent estimating firm or construction firm to provide detailed cost estimates and value engineering assistance to the subcommittee and The Nader Group.
3. Maintain this subcommittee to manage, monitor and guide the efforts of the professionals, provide feedback on the initial design process, and keep the Township Council informed.
4. The subcommittee shall continue to explore cost-saving opportunities such as a further review of the proposed summary of program space, potential impact of shared services, alternative record storage, construction methods, energy efficiency, funding sources and other meaningful methods of cost reduction.

Timeline of Subcommittee Activities

Subcommittee meeting minutes can be obtained on www.byramtwp.org under Municipal Building Subcommittee Meeting Minutes/Agendas

- May 21, 2018 - Town Council meeting (subcommittee launched & municipal building tour)
- May 31, 2018 - Initial Subcommittee meeting
- June 14, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting
- June 19, 2018 - Site Visit: Andover Township Police Department
- June 20, 2018 - Visit with State Senator Oroho to discuss proposed public-private legislation
- June 21, 2018 - Site Visit: Lafayette Municipal Building
- June 28, 2018 - Site Visit: Byram Intermediate School Open Space
- July 16, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting with Mark Alpaugh of MJA
- July 18, 2018 - Site Visit: Blairstown Municipal & Police facility
- July 24, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting w/Fred Braun regarding prior work on existing building
- August 6, 2018 - Site Visit: Stillwater Municipal Building
- August 6, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting
- August 21, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting with Byram Board of Education
- September 5, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting
- September 20, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting

- October 3, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting
- November 7, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting
- December 5, 2018 - Subcommittee meeting
- January 9, 2019 - Subcommittee meeting with The Nader Group
- February 26, 2019 - Special Joint Township Council/Building Subcommittee Meeting – The Nader Group Analysis Report
- March 4, 2019 - Subcommittee meeting with The Nader Group
- March 14, 2019 - Special Joint Township Council/Building Subcommittee Meeting – The Nader Group revised Analysis Report including more analysis of usage of Open Space
- March 25, 2019 - Subcommittee meeting – Preparing report to Township Council
- April 3, 2019 - Subcommittee meeting
- April 16, 2019 - Subcommittee Report to Township Council